Heritage Citation – Individual Place

Heritage Place: Carinya	**HO Reference:** HO762
Address: 61 Clendon Road, Toorak	**Citation status:** Final
	Date Updated: 22 March 2022
Designer: Beaver & Purnell	**Year of Construction:** 1925
Builder: Unknown	



Photograph of Carinya (source: City of Stonnington, 2020).



Location map and extent of 61 Clendon Road, Toorak.

Heritage Group: Residential building	**Key Theme:** Building suburbs
Heritage Type: House	**Key Sub-theme:** Creating Australia's most 'designed' suburbs – houses as a symbol of wealth, status and fashion

Significance Level: Local

Recommendation: Remove from the curtilage of HO143 Montalto Avenue Precinct and include on the HO as an individually significant place in its own right.

Controls:	☐	External paint colours	☐	Internal alterations	☐ Tree controls
	☐	Victorian Heritage Register	☐	Incorporated Plans	☐ Outbuildings and fences exemptions
	☐	Prohibited uses may be permitted	☐	Aboriginal Heritage Place	

Statement of Significance

What is significant?

The property at 61 Clendon Road, Toorak (otherwise known as Carinya) is significant. Specifically, the form, scale, detailing and setback of the Interwar Spanish Mission Revival residence is of local significance, as well as the original curved driveway. The front boundary wall, and later alterations and additions to the property are not significant.

How is it significant?

Carinya is of local aesthetic significance to the City of Stonnington, and is associated with the notable architectural firm, Beaver & Purnell.

Why is it significant?

Carinya is aesthetically significant as a substantially intact and well-articulated example of the Interwar Spanish Mission style erected during the interwar period. Key Spanish Mission style characteristics contributing to its aesthetic value include its distinct hipped Cordova tiled roof, arched entrance flanked by Tuscan columns, stucco walls, balanced asymmetry and use of wrought iron detailing. The deep setback and curved driveway also enhances the setting, adding a sense of formality to the property. (Criterion E)

Carinya has associative significance as a dwelling designed by the noted architectural firm Beaver & Purnell. A partnership formed by Arthur Purnell and Isidor Beaver, the duo designed in a range of domestic and commercial design styles. As one of the few intact Spanish Mission Revival style houses attributed to Beaver & Purnell, Carinya is one of the firm's more unusual designs that provides important insight into their wider body of work. (Criterion H)

HERCON Criteria Assessment

A	*Importance to the course, or pattern of our cultural or natural history*	This place does not meet this criterion.
B	*Possession of uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of our cultural or natural history*	This place does not meet this criterion.
C	*Potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of our cultural or natural history*	This place does not meet this criterion.
D	*Important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural or natural places or environments*	This place does not meet this criterion.
E	*Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics*	Carinya is aesthetically significant as a substantially intact and well-articulated example of the Spanish Mission style erected during the interwar period. Key Spanish Mission style characteristics contributing to its aesthetic value include its distinct hipped

		Cordova tiled roof, arched entrance flanked by Tuscan columns, rendered walls, balanced asymmetry and use of wrought iron detailing. The deep setback and curved driveway also enhances the setting, adding a sense of formality to the property.
F	*Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period*	This place does not meet this criterion.
G	*Strong or special association with a particular* community *or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of the continuing and developing cultural traditions*	This place does not meet this criterion.
H	*Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in our history.*	Carinya has associative significance as a dwelling designed by the noted architectural firm Beaver & Purnell. A partnership formed by Arthur Purnell and Isidor Beaver, the duo designed in a range of domestic and commercial design styles. As one of the few intact Spanish Mission Revival style houses attributed to Beaver & Purnell, Carinya is one of the firm's more unusual designs that provides important insight into their wider body of work.

Description

- ### Physical Analysis

Carinya is a two-storey mansion built in the Interwar Spanish Mission style. The residence is constructed of brick with a white stucco finish, and has a stepped floorplan that extends to the southwest. The structure features a complex hipped roof clad in terracotta Cordova tiles. There are four tall, rendered brick chimneys extending from the main roof. The chimneys feature simple recessed openings at the top with round steel chimney caps. The roof extends over the main structure with covered eaves.

The façade is asymmetrical. The main entrance is located left of centre, protected under the projecting bay. The arched entrance is flanked by paired Tuscan columns supporting a narrow, arched balcony above. The balcony is accessible through a pair of white timber louvred French doors with fanlight and is framed by the thin wrought iron balustrade. The fenestration consists of single, paired and triple timber sash windows. The windows sit behind an expressed frame and sill. The front façade includes an expressed chimney shaft extending from a ground level projection with a hipped roof with similar Cordova tile capping. An arched entrance with wrought iron gates is located to the right of the front façade at ground level.

The main structure extends to the rear and includes a garage and balcony at the westmost extent. A separate secondary structure is located to the south of, and close to, the main residence. It is sited on an angle overlooking the front garden. The single storey structure has a sympathetic form, finish and fenestration detailing in relation to the main residence. It has a double hipped roof with the north and east facing roofs raised at the centre to accommodate the second storey windows.

Carinya has a deep setback from the street. The street front boundary is demarcated by a tall rendered brick wall. Piers flank the driveway and 4opularized main gate openings. The front setback area is defined by the return paved driveway edged with brick. The front yard mostly consists of lawn with formal garden bed plantings around the main house and driveway. The driveway extends along the south boundary, around the secondary structure and to a parking area beside the garage in the main residence.

A tall rendered wall extends from the main structure to further enclose the backyard. The main residence opens to an extensive formal garden. The north elevation is protected by an open timber structure supported by round Tuscan columns. The terraced garden is stepped and laid with square concrete pavers. The formal garden is separated into smaller spaces that are defined by low rendered retaining walls and piers connected by concrete steps through the different levels. The different spaces are centred around formal plantings and a square pond. The formal garden connects to the extensive backyard which consists of groups of informal and formal planting surrounding a centred rectangular lawn. There are numerous mature trees located throughout the property.

Carinya is located at the junctions of Clendon Road with Woorigoleen Road and Clendon Court. The property is currently used as a private residence. Carinya is considered to be in good condition overall. The structure and landscape appear to be highly intact and has high integrity.

Alterations and Additions

- Round steel chimney caps added.
- Four skylights added to the main roof.
- Driveway paved.
- Parking area added to the south of the main residence.
- Low rendered front wall with tall piers replaced with a tall, rendered brick wall (after 2019).

History

Historical Context

For thousands of years preceding European colonialism, the area now known as Stonnington was the traditional home of the Woi wurrung and Boon wurrung people of the Eastern Kulin Nation. This environment would have provided Traditional Owners with access to pre-contact plains, grassy woodland, and floodplains on the banks of the Yarra River (Birrarung), Gardiners Creek (Kooyong Koot), and Hawksburn Creek (now 4opularized), in a rolling landscape on the northern shore of Port Phillip Bay. It is important to note that the rich cultural heritage of Traditional Owners in Stonnington did not end with colonialism—it has a rich presence to this day.

Following the establishment of Melbourne in 1835, squatter John Gardiner and many others like him sought out land in what would become present day Toorak and surrounds on account of its densely timbered landscape, undulating terrain and proximity to water. By 1840, crown land sales marked the

area's transition to pastoral settlement, and later in 1851, with the purchase of land in Hawthorn by Thomas Herbert Power, the surrounding environments gradually became a place where the early merchant and squatter elite of Melbourne built their homesteads. In Toorak, this is best represented by the purchase of lot 26 by James Jackson, associate in Jackson, Rae & Co. soap and candle merchants. Jackson was described by politician William Westgarth as 'Melbourne's greatest merchant of this early time' (Forster 1999, 10). It is only fitting that his house, called Toorak House, would be the namesake of what would become arguably the most affluent suburb in Melbourne. Following the discovery of gold in the 1850s and the wealth this produced for ancillary trades, the Toorak area drew in Melbourne's newly wealthy. Today, over a century later, Toorak still has connotations of wealth and prestige as best represented in its history and built environment (Forster 1999, 5–26).

- Place History

The residence known as Carinya was designed by the architectural firm Beaver & Purnell in 1925. William Purnell was an Australian architect from Geelong who lived and worked in China between 1900 and 1910 and established the architectural and engineering firm Purnell & Paget in Guangzhou (Groves 2009, 24). Purnell returned to Australia in 1910 and maintained an architectural practice in Melbourne on his own and in partnership with others until the 1950s. His most notable designs in Melbourne include the Olympic stand at the Melbourne Cricket Ground. Isidor George Beaver was a Melbourne architect originally form Manchester, England. He established the architectural firm Beaver & Purnell in Melbourne. Together, Beaver and Purnell worked on a wide variety of architectural designs including insignificant and fiddly designs (Groves 2009, 24).

The land on which the residence is located was formerly part of the Coonac Estate which was established in 1866/67 for Robert Bruce Ronald, Victorian manager of the Australian Mercantile Land and Finance Co (MMBW detail plan 974, 1900). During the 1920s and 1930s the area surrounding this estate was a site of intense development and underwent a series of subdivisions. As a result, part of the garden landscaping of Coonac Estate was subdivided to form the current allotment for Carinya.

Carinya was constructed in 1925 for Herbert William Lee. Lee was the director of wool and skin brokers W. Lee and Sons Pty Ltd Melbourne and Macauley. He died at Carinya in 1945 (THE ARGUS 1945, 2).

It appears that the Lees sold the property shortly after the death of Herbert William Lee. The property was occupied next by Thomas Trevaskis until c.1970 (Sands and McDougall 1955;1965). The last known occupier of the residence was Mrs R.W. Bryant (Sands and McDougall (1970; 1974). The property continued to change hands and was last sold in 2013.

Comparative Analysis

Erected in 1925, Carinya was designed by the notable architectural firm Beaver & Purnell in an early example of the Spanish Mission Revival style that was 5opularized during the interwar period. A partnership between William Arthur Purnell and Isidor Beaver during the interwar years, the firm practiced in a variety of domestic and commercial design styles that ranged from the American Bungalow at 17 Robe Street, St Kilda (HO5 Port Phillip City), to the Chinese derived Tsoshaan Flats at 1-7/777 Malvern Road, Toorak (HO79). Given the versatility of their designs, there is only one other architecturally comparable example within the municipality that is attributed to the duo:

- **Shan Teng (492 Punt Road and 2B Gordon Grove, South Yarra) (individually significant in HO122 precinct).** Initially designed by Beaver & Purnell in 1924, in a Spanish Mission style, this one-storey dwelling was later given the name Shan Teng and was substantially altered by Purnell in 1925 to incorporate Chinese design elements. While Shan Teng is distinct for its Chinese temple-style hipped tile roof, the Spanish Mission style elements from the original 1924 dwelling are directly comparable to Carinya. These features include smooth rendered walls, restrained ornamentation, a pitched roof form and subtle decorative carved detailing on the exterior wall.

Other comparable dwellings within the municipality that are not designed by Beaver & Purnell include:

- **232 Kooyong Road, Toorak (HO505).** Erected in 1927, this residence was designed by Cedric Ballantyne and the 1937 additions were designed by Marcus Martin. It is comparable to Carinya as a substantial double-storey Spanish Mission revival style house that incorporates a low pitched hipped Cordova tiled roof with broad eaves, wrought iron detailing, and arched openings. As with Carinya, its formality is enhanced by its deep setback from the street and formal curved driveway. Key differences include its fenestration and its textured rough trowelled render.
- **Banghory House (6 Glyndebourne Avenue, Toorak) (HO264).** Constructed in 1926 to designs by Marcus Martin, this house is directly comparable to Carinya as an early example of the Spanish Revival idiom that incorporates all the design elements typically associated with the style. While it is a more articulated representation of the style by virtue of its informal T-shaped layout and use of barley twist columns along its loggia, it maintains several notable similarities. These include the Cordova tiled roof, arched porch, and fenestration.

Carinya is a high quality and early representation of the Spanish Mission Revival style in the municipality. It directly compares to existing examples on the Heritage Overlay, and is also notable as one of the few intact Spanish Mission houses designed by noted Melbourne architectural firm Beaver & Purnell. In this way, it also provides insight into the scale of their portfolio of work.

References

Context Pty Ltd. 2009. 'Stonnington Thematic Environmental History.' Unpublished report prepared for City of Stonnington. PDF file.

Foster, D. 1999. 'Melbourne's Most Fashionable Suburb: A History of Toorak, East of Kooyong Road 1840–1998.' Unpublished Masters diss., Monash University.

Groves, D. 2009. 'The Barlow file: Another adventure in building.' *University of Melbourne Collections* issue 5: 24-33.

State Library of Victoria, Melbourne & Metropolitan Board of Works, detail plan No. 974, dated 1900.

Stonnington City Council. 2008. Heritage Citation Report: Banghory House, 8 Glyndebourne Avenue, Toorak, Hermes ID 31158. Unpublished report. PDF file.

Stonnington City Council. 2017. Heritage Citation Report: Residence, 232 Kooyong Road, Toorak, Hermes ID 200331. Unpublished report. PDF file.

Taylor, D. M. 1989. 'The Surrounds Layout and Form of Spanish Mission Style Gardens of the 1920s.' Graduate report., The University of New South Wales.

THE ARGUS. 1945. ‘Deaths on Active Service. 15 November, 2.

Limitations

1. Access to all heritage places was limited to a visual inspection from the public domain. The interiors of buildings and inaccessible areas such as rear gardens were not accessed as part of this heritage study.
2. Condition and site modification assessment was limited to a visual inspection undertaken from the public domain.
3. The historical notes provided for this citation are not considered to be an exhaustive history of the site.

Further Images



View of façade from the front driveway (source: www.domain.com.au, 2020).



North-west view from the front driveway (source: www.domain.com.au, 2020).



View from Clendon Road, looking west (source: Extent Heritage, 2021).



View from Clendon Road, looking east (source: Extent Heritage, 2021).



Detail of the roof, second storey fenestration and wrought iron balustrade (source: www.domain.com.au, 2020).



Detail or arched entrance and Tuscan columns (source: www.domain.com.au, 2020).

Authors

Former citation prepared by: Context Pty Ltd, 1993. *Note: the building was included in precinct citation for HO143.*

Updated citation prepared by: Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2022 (Vivian Lu, Gabrielle Harrington and Reuel Balmadres).

Quality assurance review conducted by: Corinne Softley.