

## Heritage Citation – Individual Place

**Heritage Place:** Hillcrest

**Address:** 1 and 2/1043 Malvern Road, Toorak

**HO Reference:** HO324

**Citation status:** Final

**Date Updated:** 17 March 2022

**Designer:** Unknown

**Year of Construction:** 1889

**Builder:** Unknown



Photograph of Hillcrest (source: Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2021).



Location map and extent of HO324.

**Heritage Group:** Residential buildings

**Heritage Type:** House (with a granny flat at rear)

**Key Theme:** Buildings suburbs

**Key Sub-theme:** Creating Australia's most 'prestigious' suburbs – the end of an era – mansion estate subdivisions in the 20th century

**Significance Level:** Local

**Recommendation:** Retain as an individually significant place on the HO

**Controls:**



External paint colours



Internal alterations



Tree controls



Victorian Heritage Register



Incorporated Plans



Outbuildings and fences exemptions



Prohibited uses may be permitted



Aboriginal Heritage Place

## Statement of Significance

### *What is significant?*

The property at 1043 Malvern Road, Toorak (otherwise known as Hillcrest) is significant. Specifically, the form, scale and detailing of the Victorian Italianate villa is of local significance. The landscaping, front fence and later alterations and additions are not significant.

### *How is it significant?*

Hillcrest is of local historical and aesthetic significance to the City of Stonington.

### *Why is it significant?*

Hillcrest is historically significant in demonstrating the development of late Victorian villas within Toorak during the late 19th century, following the wider subdivision of the Victorian era estates. The house is also of historical significance in demonstrating residential development in the south eastern suburbs by Melbourne's wealthiest citizens during the gold rush period. (Criterion A)

Hillcrest has aesthetic significance as a high-quality, fine and intact example of a Victorian Italianate villa with a prominent and visually striking tower. Key characteristics that contribute towards this aesthetic value include the use of stucco render, a half polygonal bay window, decorative bracketing under the eaves, timber joinery, an elaborate rectilinear tower with a parapet and the hipped slate roof. (Criterion E)

## HERCON Criteria Assessment

A	<i>Importance to the course, or pattern of our cultural or natural history</i>	Hillcrest is historically significant in demonstrating the development of late Victorian villas within Toorak during the late 19th century, following the wider subdivision of the Victorian era estates. The house is also of historical significance in demonstrating residential development in the south eastern suburbs by Melbourne's wealthiest citizens during the gold rush period.
B	<i>Possession of uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of our cultural or natural history</i>	This place does not meet this criterion.
C	<i>Potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of our cultural or natural history</i>	This place does not meet this criterion.
D	<i>Important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural or natural places or environments</i>	This place does not meet this criterion.
E	<i>Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics</i>	Hillcrest has aesthetic significance as a high-quality, fine and intact example of a Victorian Italianate villa with a prominent and visually

		striking tower. Key characteristics that contribute towards this aesthetic value include the use of stucco render, a half polygonal bay window, decorative bracketing under the eaves, timber joinery, an elaborate rectilinear tower with a parapet and the hipped slate roof.
F	<i>Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period</i>	This place does not meet this criterion.
G	<i>Strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of the continuing and developing cultural traditions</i>	This place does not meet this criterion.
H	<i>Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in our history.</i>	This place does not meet this criterion.

## Description

### • Physical Analysis

Hillcrest is a single-storey villa designed in a Victorian Italianate style. The masonry structure is rendered in a white stucco. The house features an M-shaped hipped slate tile roof typical of the Italianate style, however also including an unusual second storey centred tower that is square in plan. There are six rendered corbelled chimneys with a form typical of the Italianate design. The chimneys are highly detailed with expressed textured mouldings, paired flower mouldings between corbels and paired brackets under the chimney cap. The slate roof has metal ridge capping and is supported by paired bracketed eaves with flower and festoon mouldings located in between.

The front façade presents asymmetrically with a projecting half polygonal bay characteristic of Italianate structures. The bay features arched windows on each face flanked by piers with feathered mouldings supporting a label moulding with keystone. The junction between the bay and the main structure is emphasised by textured rendered quoining. In addition to the bay projection, the façade features a centred bank of three white timber sash windows. The centred second level tower extends over the front façade. Each face of the tower features a pair of centred narrow double hung sash windows. The windows are expressed horizontally on the façade by a string course with feathered mouldings supporting two label moulds with keystone. The windows are flanked by two engaged piers in a stylised Corinthian order. The columns support an upper string course and a group of three paired brackets with flower and festoon mouldings. The brackets support a slightly projecting cornice that terminates at the flat parapet of the tower.

The main structure is set back from the street and separated by a front lawn. There are two garden sheds in the front yard at the south-west corner of the site. There are several extensions off the north side of the main structure occupying the majority of the rear of the property. There are two interconnected flat roof extensions off the northwest corner of the main structure, occupying the west and northwest boundary of the site. There is a large single storey addition located off the northeast side of the main property. The extension is square in plan with a terracotta tile clad hipped roof, and appears to be a granny flat. There is an internal courtyard between the main house and extensions with a timber pergola.

The front lawn is landscaped, albeit overgrown. There are mature trees located in the front yard including a fig and arborvitae tree. The rear of the property is largely occupied by subsequent unsympathetic extensions. The street front boundary is demarcated by a timber panel fence with timber lattice. There is an entrance gate flanked by two large timber posts with hipped caps.

Hillcrest is located close to the junctions with Huntingtower Road and Denham Place. It is located opposite the Lauriston Girls School. The stucco render, particularly on the tower, is in poor condition. Additionally, several windows at the tower have been boarded up. This property would therefore be considered in poor condition. 1043 Malvern Street is part of a group of three similar buildings. The original structure has been highly altered with extensions to the north side. Additionally, there have been major additions to the villa that has occupied most of the former backyard area. The front verandah, which is typical of the Italianate style, has been removed. Therefore, this property would be considered to have moderate integrity.

- [Alterations and Additions](#)

- Front verandah on the south façade removed.
- Original timber fence on the street front boundary removed.
- Rear additions to the villa.
- Timber panel fence with lattice added.
- Garden sheds in the front yard added.
- Two additional structures added to the backyard with flat corrugated iron roof.
- Antenna added to the roof.

## [History](#)

- [Historical Context](#)

For thousands of years preceding European colonialism, the area now known as Stonnington was the traditional home of the Woiwurrung and Boonwurrung people of the Eastern Kulin Nation. This environment would have provided Traditional Owners with access to pre-contact plains, grassy woodland, and floodplains on the banks of the Yarra River (Birrarung), Gardiners Creek (Kooyong Koot), and Hawksburn Creek (now channelised), in a rolling landscape on the northern shore of Port Phillip Bay. It is important to note that the rich cultural heritage of Traditional Owners in Stonnington did not end with colonialism—it has a rich presence to this day.

Following the establishment of Melbourne in 1835, squatter John Gardiner and many others like him sought out land in what would become present day Toorak and surrounds on account of its densely timbered landscape, undulating terrain and proximity to water. By 1840, crown land sales marked the

area's transition to pastoral settlement, and later in 1851, with the purchase of land in Hawthorn by Thomas Herbert Power, the surrounding environments gradually became a place where the early merchant and squatter elite of Melbourne built their homesteads. In Toorak, this is best represented by the purchase of lot 26 by James Jackson, associate in Jackson, Rae & Co. soap and candle merchants. Jackson was described by politician William Westgarth as 'Melbourne's greatest merchant of this early time' (Forster 1999, 10). It is only fitting that his house, called Toorak House, would be the namesake of what would become arguably the most affluent suburb in Melbourne. Following the discovery of gold in the 1850s and the wealth this produced for ancillary trades, the Toorak area drew in Melbourne's newly wealthy. Today, over a century later, Toorak still has connotations of wealth and prestige as best represented in its history and built environment (Forster 1999, 5–26).

- ### Place History

The land that Hillcrest would later come to occupy was formerly part of the Albany Estate. Following the estate's subdivision in 1888, Lot 2 was purchased by J. W. Stoddart and by 1889, the construction of a dwelling on the site had commenced (Malvern Rate Books). It is not known whether Stoddart ever resided in the dwelling, and by 1890, Louisa E. Stoddart is listed in records as the official owner and occupier of the dwelling (Sands & McDougall 1890).

Louisa Stoddart subsequently leased the house to Dr. Ronald in 1891, and then to Christina Campbell by 1895 (Malvern Rate Books, Sands & McDougall 1895). While the dwelling passed through several more occupants over the next two decades, the dearth of historical material has made it difficult to verify the owner during this period. An illustration of the property from a 1902 MMBW plan shows a projecting bay window and bathroom, as well as a similarly designed dwellings to its east and west (MMBW 1902).

By 1930, Patrick McVickar is listed as the owner and occupant of 1043 Malvern Road (then 31 Malvern Road) (Sands & McDougall 1930). While a newspaper article indicates that McVickar occupied the house from as early as 1918, this needs further verification (The Argus 1918, 1). Born in Ireland, McVickar joined the staff of the Bank of Victoria upon his migration to Australia in 1886 (The Argus 1937, 2). He later rose to become the chief manager of the Bank of Victoria and the Commercial Banking Company of Sydney (The Argus 1937, 2). He was the treasurer of the Eye and Ear Hospital the time of his occupancy at 1043 Malvern Road, and resided there with his wife Mary (née Meek) and daughters Marjorie Coward, Nancy and Patricia until his death in 1937 (The Argus 1937, 2). The dwelling was known as Dromana during the McVickar occupancy (The Age 1937, 12).

Following Patrick McVickar's death, the house was sold to Dr Guy Reynolds, who is listed as the owner and occupier from c. 1940 (Sands and McDougall 1940). He is attributed to the dwelling until at least 1965, marking an impressive two-and-a-half-decade occupancy. Although not much is known about Reynolds, an obituary reveals that he was the son of Jane Mary Hutchinson and lawyer Thomas O'Loughlen Reynolds, the former deputy chairman of the Melbourne and Metropolitan Tramway Boards and director of the Federal Mutual Insurance Co. of Australia Ltd (The Australasian 1931, 9). At the time of his father's passing in 1931, Guy Reynolds was a medical student at the University of Melbourne (The Australasian 1931, 9). Reynolds' occupancy saw the addition of a flat at the rear of the property in 1946. An architectural drawing by the notable architectural firm Godfrey & Spowers, Hughes, Mewton and Lobb reveals plans for a self-contained one-storey flat adjoining the north-eastern corner of the dwelling (Godfrey & Spowers, Hughes, Mewton and Lobb 1946). Featuring a pyramid hipped roof, the addition

comprised two bedrooms, an open plan living and dining room, kitchen, laundry, bathroom, terrace and two porches (Godrey & Spowers, Hughes, Mewton and Lobb 1946).

From c.1970, F. M. Johnson and B Bullock are listed in records as the official occupants of 1043 Malvern Road (Sands & McDougall 1970, 1974). As there are two names listed, it is likely that one of them resided in the self-contained flat added by Reynolds in the decades prior. It remains unknown as to how long Johnson and Bullock occupied the dwelling.

### Comparative Analysis

As there is no known architect for Hillcrest, the following comparative analysis focuses on domestic examples within the municipality with similar architectural features, notably the projecting tower. Comparative examples include:

- **House (6 Horsburgh Grove, Armadale) (HO315).** The house at 6 Horsburgh Grove, Armadale (incorrectly listed as Malvern in its citation), is a single-storey boom-era Italianate villa constructed in 1887, two years prior to the house at 1043 Malvern Road, Toorak. Both houses are comparable as they are examples of the type of infill villa development constructed following the initial subdivision of the Victorian estates, and observe the same late Victorian design principles. Whilst the house at 1043 has a tower projecting from the M-shaped hipped roof, the house at 6 Horsburgh Grove has an intact and original lantern which draws a similar level of visual interest to the property. Other shared characteristics include the use of projecting bay windows, a hipped roof form, stucco render with decorative bracketing under the eaves, and sash windows. This example is more intact than 1043 Malvern Road, retaining its verandah.
- **Blairholme House (formerly Awbridge) (1034-1040 Malvern Road, Armadale) (HO528).** Blairholme (formerly Awbridge) was built in 1887 and comprises a large single storey Italianate villa with a central landmark tower set in an expansive garden setting. Nearly directly opposite the house at 1043 Malvern Road, Blairholme is a comparable example of a house built within the same late Victorian boom-era period, sharing a very similar, if not marginally larger, built form. Aside from the tower, shared characteristics include the hipped roof form, stucco render, decorative bracketing under the eaves and Italianate chimney caps. This example is more intact than 1043 Malvern Road, retaining its verandah.
- **Ailu (12 Russell Street, Camberwell) (HO159).** The house at 12 Russell Street, Camberwell otherwise known as Ailu, was constructed in 1885 in a design similar to the house at 1043 Malvern Road, Toorak. Both houses are boom-era Italianate villas and both structures are fitted with towers. However, it must be acknowledged that the tower at Ailu is substantially larger than that represented at 1043 Malvern Road. Other shared characteristics include the late Victorian form with hipped slate roof, projecting bays, Italianate chimney caps, stucco render and decorative bracketing under the eaves. This example is more intact than 1043 Malvern Road, retaining its verandah.

It must be noted that the house at 1043 Malvern Road, Toorak, would have originally been fitted with a verandah complete with wrought iron lacework. However, this has been removed. If it were still extant the building would compare more equally in terms of intactness.

It must also be noted that the property at 1049 Malvern Road, the subject site's neighboring property to the east, also observes the same built form complete with a tower. However, renovations to this



property have impacted the site's integrity, stripping a large degree of the decorative stucco render from the tower. It is thus not included on the Heritage Overlay.

## References

Boroondara City Council. 2008. Heritage Citation Report: 12 Russell Street, Camberwell, Hermes ID 50197. Unpublished report. PDF file.

Context Pty Ltd. 2009. 'Stonnington Thematic Environmental History.' Unpublished report prepared for City of Stonnington. PDF file.

DEATH OF MR. REYNOLDS. (1931, April 11). *The Australasian*, 9.

Foster, D. 1999. 'Melbourne's Most Fashionable Suburb: A History of Toorak, East of Kooyong Road 1840–1998.' Unpublished Masters diss., Monash University.

Godfrey & Spowers, Hughes, Mewton and Lobb. (1946, September). *Addition of Flat 1043 Malvern Road, Toorak* [architectural drawing and plan]. Stonnington History Centre collection.

John Curtis and Associates with Graeme Butler. 1991. *Prahran Character and Conservation Study*. Unpublished report prepared for City of Prahran. PDF File.

Malvern Rate Books.

Marriages. (1918, November 20). *The Argus*, 1.

Mr. P. McVickar. (1937, October 21). *The Age*, 12.

OBITUARY: Mr. Patrick McVickar. (1937, October 21). *The Argus*, 2.

State Library of Victoria, Melbourne & Metropolitan Board of Works, detail plan No. 1768, dated 1902.

State Library of Victoria, Sands & McDougall Street Directories of Victoria, 1895-1974 ed.

Stonnington City Council. 2008. Heritage Citation Report: House, Horsburgh Grove, Malvern, Hermes ID 31348. Unpublished report. PDF file.

Stonnington City Council. 2016. Heritage Citation Report: Blairholme House (formerly Awbridge), 1034-1040 Malvern Road, Armadale, Hermes ID 200136. Unpublished report. PDF file.

## Limitations

1. Access to all heritage places was limited to a visual inspection from the public domain. The interiors of buildings and inaccessible areas such as rear gardens were not accessed as part of this heritage study.
2. Condition and site modification assessment was limited to a visual inspection undertaken from the public domain.
3. The historical notes provided for this citation are not considered to be an exhaustive history of the site.

## Further Images



Architectural drawings of 1944 additions (source: Godfrey & Spowers, Hughes, Mewton and Lobb. (1946, September). *Addition of Flat 1043 Malvern Road, Toorak* [architectural drawing and plan]. Stonnington History Centre collection).



Overview of dwelling from the opposite side of the street (source: Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2021).



View of the square tower projecting above the hipped roof (source: Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2021).





Chimney detail (source: Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2021).



Detail view of the square tower projecting above the hipped roof (source: Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2021).



Front gate (source: Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2021).



Detail of decorative mouldings below the eaves (source: Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2021).

## Authors

**Former citation prepared by:** John Curtis and Associates with Graeme Butler, 1991.

**Updated citation prepared by:** Extent Heritage Pty Ltd, 2022.